

The Role of Compliance and Gratitude in Improving the Psychological Well-being of Early Childhood Education Teachers: A Literature Review

Yuniati Ningsih¹, Muhammad Farid², Isrida Yul Arifiana³

^{1,2,3}University of 17 August 1945 Surabaya, Indonesia



DOI : <https://doi.org/10.61796/ijmi.v3i1.385>



Section Info

Article history:

Submitted: June 27, 2025

Final Revised: July 10, 2025

Accepted: July 22, 2025

Published: August 28, 2025

Keywords:

Compliance

Gratitude

Psychological well-being

Early childhood education teachers

Islamic boarding schools

ABSTRACT

Objective: This study aims to comprehensively review the role of obedience and gratitude in improving the psychological well-being of non-civil servant early childhood education (PAUD) teachers, particularly in Islamic boarding schools (pesantren). Early childhood education (PAUD) teachers face significant challenges related to financial well-being, employment status, and high workloads, which have the potential to cause stress and reduce psychological well-being. **Method:** Through a literature review, this study found that obedience based on self-awareness, religious values, and moral responsibility can provide a sense of security, order, and satisfaction in carrying out tasks. **Results:** Meanwhile, gratitude has been shown to play a significant role in fostering positive emotions, reducing stress, strengthening social relationships, and helping teachers interpret limitations as a form of devotion. In the context of Islamic boarding school culture, the value of obedience reflected in the philosophy of "Bhuppa' Bhâbbhu' Ghuru Rato" and gratitude rooted in religious teachings strengthen teachers' resilience to remain dedicated. Thus, it can be concluded that obedience and gratitude are important psychological factors that complement each other in maintaining the psychological well-being of PAUD teachers. **Novelty:** These findings have practical implications for schools, Islamic boarding school foundations, and the government in formulating development strategies and policies that support the welfare of non-civil servant PAUD teachers more comprehensively.

INTRODUCTION

Early Childhood Education (PAUD) is an important foundation in preparing a quality generation of the nation [1]. PAUD teachers have a strategic role in shaping children's character, attitudes, and basic skills [2]. However, the psychological well-being of PAUD teachers, especially non-civil servant teachers, is still often neglected. In fact, psychological well-being is an important aspect that supports performance, creativity, and motivation in carrying out teaching duties [3]. Non-civil servant PAUD teachers often face more difficult challenges than civil servant teachers. They are faced with limited financial well-being, uncertain employment status, and high work demands. These conditions can cause psychological pressure, work stress, and emotional exhaustion. Therefore, internal factors are needed to maintain the stability of their psychological well-being, one of which is through compliance and gratitude.

Psychological well-being is defined as an individual's optimal state of well-being characterized by self-acceptance, positive relationships with others, a clear sense of purpose, personal growth, autonomy, and environmental mastery [4]. In the context of early childhood education (PAUD) teachers, good psychological well-being enables them to be more productive, patient, and sincere in educating early childhood [5]. Compliance is an important aspect that influences a teacher's psychological well-being. In an Islamic

boarding school environment, compliance is not only interpreted as adherence to formal rules, but also to highly respected religious and moral values. Teachers who are able to comply with rules with self-awareness tend to feel safe and comfortable, and are able to reduce psychological conflict in their work.

On the other hand, gratitude acts as a psychological mechanism that fosters positive emotions. Teachers who exhibit a grateful attitude are able to see the positive side of their work despite limitations. This attitude fosters satisfaction, increases work enthusiasm, and strengthens social relationships with the environment. Gratitude also helps teachers interpret their work as a form of worship, especially in the context of Islamic boarding schools (*pesantren*) which are steeped in religious values. Previous research has shown that compliance is positively related to psychological well-being, where teachers who comply with regulations feel safer and more satisfied with their roles [6]. Meanwhile, gratitude has been shown to increase subjective well-being, life satisfaction, and reduce stress [7]. This demonstrates the significant contribution of both variables to teacher well-being.

In the context of Islamic boarding school culture and Madurese society, the values of obedience and gratitude play an increasingly strong role. The proverb "Bhuppa' Bhâbbhu' Ghuru Rato" describes a hierarchy of obedience to parents, teachers and leaders. Meanwhile, the value of gratitude is taught as a form of acceptance of existing conditions, so that non-PNS PAUD teachers remain able to be dedicated even though they face limitations. A review of literature regarding the role of obedience and gratitude shows that there is a significant contribution in maintaining and improving the psychological well-being of PAUD teachers. With good psychological well-being, teachers can face work challenges with more resilience, are able to maintain motivation, and remain enthusiastic in carrying out the task of educating early childhood.

The urgency of this literature review lies in the need for a deeper understanding of the psychological factors that contribute to the well-being of non-civil servant early childhood education (PAUD) teachers. By understanding the role of obedience and gratitude, it is hoped that schools, Islamic boarding school foundations, and the government can formulate policy strategies and intervention programs that support teacher well-being comprehensively. Therefore, this article aims to comprehensively review the role of obedience and gratitude in improving the psychological well-being of non-civil servant early childhood education (PAUD) teachers, particularly in Islamic boarding school environments. Through this literature review, it is hoped that a broader understanding of the psychological dynamics of PAUD teachers and their implications for the development of early childhood education in Indonesia will be gained.

RESEARCH METHOD

This study uses a literature review approach with the aim of in-depth examining the role of compliance and gratitude in improving the psychological well-being of non-civil servant early childhood education (PAUD) teachers, particularly in Islamic boarding schools (*pesantren*). The literature review method was chosen because it allows

researchers to examine, compare, and synthesize the results of previous studies to obtain a comprehensive picture of the research topic.

Data source

Research data was obtained from various relevant literature, including national and international journal articles, reference books, research reports, and other academic documents addressing the themes of compliance, gratitude, and psychological well-being. Literature sources were accessed through electronic databases such as Google Scholar, ResearchGate, and DOAJ, as well as from credible print sources.

Analysis Procedure

The analysis stages include (1) collecting literature according to keywords; (2) initial selection and review based on relevance; (3) grouping literature based on research variables (compliance, gratitude, psychological well-being); and (4) synthesizing findings to build a conceptual framework. The analysis technique was carried out using content analysis, namely reading, categorizing, and interpreting the contents of the literature to find patterns, similarities, and differences between various research results.

Validity of the Study

To ensure validity, the researchers used literature sourced from reputable journals and trusted academic books. Furthermore, source triangulation was conducted by comparing the results of different studies to obtain stronger and more accountable conclusions. With this method, it is hoped that this article will provide a comprehensive overview of how compliance and gratitude contribute to the psychological well-being of non-civil servant early childhood education teachers in Islamic boarding schools.

RESULTS AND DISCUSSION

Results

1. Compliance

Compliance is a psychological concept that is widely studied in educational, social, and religious contexts. In general, compliance is defined as a person's behavior in following applicable rules, norms, instructions, or commands [8]. According to Blass, compliance is an individual's willingness to adjust their behavior to the demands of authority, either voluntarily or due to social pressure [9]. In the context of early childhood education teachers, compliance is not only related to school administrative rules, but also related to the moral and religious values held. Ajzen in the Theory of Planned Behavior explains that compliance is closely related to an individual's belief in subjective norms and perceptions of self-control [10]. This means that compliance arises not only because of external coercion, but also because of an internal awareness to act in accordance with believed values. This confirms that compliance has a complex psychological dimension, encompassing both internal and external factors.

Bandura emphasized that compliance can be influenced by cognitive, social, and environmental factors. [9] For example, individuals in environments with a clear rule structure tend to be more obedient than those in environments without control. In the context of Islamic boarding schools, compliance is reinforced by the role of the kiai or

teacher as a respected authority figure. Compliance can be divided into three forms: external, internal, and social compliance. [9] External compliance occurs due to external pressure, such as punishment or sanctions. Internal compliance arises from self-awareness, values, and personal responsibility. Meanwhile, social compliance arises from the influence of groups or communities. These three forms of compliance complement each other and determine how individuals respond to the demands of their environment.

Internal factors influencing compliance include motivation, personal values, personality, and self-awareness [11]. Meanwhile, external factors can include social pressure, incentives, punishment, culture, and authority figures. In the context of non-civil servant early childhood education teachers, internal factors such as religious beliefs and moral responsibility are often the main drivers of compliance, although external conditions such as limited salary and status still exert pressure.

In Islamic boarding schools, obedience has a broader meaning. The Madurese proverb "Bhuppa' Bhâbbhu' Ghuru Rato" illustrates the hierarchy of obedience that must be upheld: to parents, teachers/ulama, and leaders. For early childhood education teachers in Islamic boarding schools, obedience is not merely administrative obedience, but also part of worship and devotion. This value strengthens the internal motivation to remain faithful in carrying out their duties despite facing various limitations.

Several studies have shown that compliance is linked to psychological well-being. Ahmad & Rachmawati found that teachers who comply with school rules feel more secure and satisfied with their roles [6]. This is because compliance provides a sense of order, reduces conflict, and increases a sense of belonging to the institution. Thus, compliance can be seen as a protective factor in maintaining psychological stability. However, compliance can also be a psychological burden if carried out under duress without in-depth understanding. Jannah emphasized that compliance that arises from coercion or pressure can cause stress, emotional exhaustion, and even burnout [12]. Therefore, it is important to distinguish between conscious and voluntary compliance and compliance that arises solely due to external pressure.

From an educational psychology perspective, teacher compliance contributes to the creation of a conducive school climate [13]. Teachers who comply with regulations tend to be role models for students, maintain discipline, and build harmonious relationships with colleagues. This, in turn, can improve the quality of learning in early childhood education (PAUD). Thus, compliance is not only important for teacher well-being but also impacts child development. Based on the literature, it can be concluded that compliance is an important aspect that influences the psychological well-being of PAUD teachers, especially in Islamic boarding schools. Compliance based on awareness, religious values, and internal motivation can strengthen teachers' psychological resilience. Conversely, compliance that arises solely from pressure can have negative impacts. Therefore, a comprehensive understanding of compliance needs to be the basis for efforts to improve the psychological well-being of non-civil servant PAUD teachers.

2. Gratitude

Gratitude is a positive psychological concept that has been widely studied in relation to subjective and psychological well-being. Emmons & McCullough define gratitude as an individual's ability to recognize and appreciate positive things in life and realize that this goodness comes from outside themselves. Gratitude is not just a feeling of satisfaction, but an active attitude in appreciating the gifts received [7]. According to Seligman, gratitude has an important function in increasing awareness of positive things, strengthening social relationships, and fostering feelings of happiness [14]. By developing gratitude, individuals are able to reduce anxiety and stress, and are more resilient in the face of difficulties. This makes gratitude one of the psychological strategies that is influential in building psychological well-being [15].

Lyubomirsky explains that gratitude can generate positive emotions that broaden an individual's mindset (broaden and build theory) [16]. These positive emotions encourage a person to be more optimistic, productive, and have higher energy in their work. Non-civil servant early childhood education teachers who are accustomed to gratitude will find it easier to give meaning to their work, even though they face limitations in salary and status. Aspects of gratitude according to Fitzgerald include positive feelings towards life, recognition of kindness received, and a tendency to repay that kindness [17]. In the world of education, teachers who have a sense of gratitude not only feel satisfied with their role, but also strive to make more contributions to their students as a form of devotion.

Many empirical studies have demonstrated a positive relationship between gratitude and psychological well-being. For example, Ismawati found that gratitude is positively correlated with the psychological well-being of non-civil servant teachers [18]. The higher the level of gratitude teachers have, the better their psychological well-being. This finding aligns with research by Hernanda et al. which shows that gratitude significantly contributes to work-life balance and the psychological well-being of teaching staff [13]. In the context of Islamic boarding schools, gratitude has a strong spiritual value. Non-civil servant early childhood education (PAUD) teachers often view their work as worship, thus viewing the limitations they face as part of their devotion. This sense of gratitude helps them persist with high dedication, despite inadequate financial well-being. Gratitude has also been shown to help individuals build better social relationships. Loi & Ng found that gratitude is associated with happiness, life satisfaction, spirituality, and meaningful work experiences [18]. Grateful teachers tend to have more positive social interactions with colleagues, students, and the environment, ultimately improving their psychological well-being.

Furthermore, gratitude is also a protective factor against work stress. Research by Zheng et al. shows that gratitude is related to teachers' psychological well-being and the quality of teacher-student relationships [19]. In the context of early childhood education (PAUD) teachers, gratitude helps them manage administrative pressure, high workloads, and limited facilities with more calm and optimism. Several studies in Indonesia also confirm the role of gratitude in teacher well-being. Yulianti found a significant positive

relationship between gratitude and the psychological well-being of contract teachers [20]. Scarvanovi also showed that PAUD teachers with high levels of gratitude are better able to maintain emotional stability and feel satisfied with their roles despite facing limitations [21]. Based on the literature review, it can be concluded that gratitude is an important factor influencing the psychological well-being of PAUD teachers. Gratitude helps teachers focus on positive things, fosters satisfaction, strengthens social relationships, and maintains work motivation. In the context of Islamic boarding schools, gratitude becomes a religious value that further strengthens the psychological well-being of teachers, so that they are able to carry out educational tasks with full dedication and enthusiasm.

3. Psychological Well-being

Psychological well-being is a key concept in positive psychology, referring to a person's optimal state of life. Ryff defines psychological well-being as a state in which an individual is able to recognize their potential, develop positive capacities, maintain healthy relationships, and have a meaningful purpose in life. This concept emphasizes the balance between internal and external factors in shaping an individual's quality of life. Ryff divides psychological well-being into six dimensions: self-acceptance, positive relations with others, autonomy, environmental mastery, purpose in life, and personal growth. These six aspects are important indicators in assessing the extent to which a person has a healthy psychological condition [4].

Deci & Ryan in Self-Determination Theory added that psychological well-being is achieved through the fulfillment of three basic needs, namely autonomy, competence, and social connectedness [22]. Individuals who feel free to make their own choices, have the ability to work, and receive social support tend to have higher psychological well-being. This is relevant in the context of early childhood education teachers, whose well-being is greatly influenced by working conditions and environmental support. Seligman expanded the concept of psychological well-being through the PERMA (Positive Emotion, Engagement, Relationship, Meaning, Accomplishment) model [23]. According to him, well-being includes not only emotional aspects, but also involvement in meaningful activities, positive social relationships, a sense of purpose, and achievement. For early childhood education teachers, the feeling of meaning in educating early childhood is a major source of psychological well-being.

Myers emphasized that psychological well-being is an optimal mental state in which an individual is able to maintain a balance between personal needs and environmental demands [24]. In other words, teachers who have good psychological well-being are not easily stressed even though they face limitations in salary, status, and workload. They are able to adapt and remain productive in their work. Factors that influence psychological well-being can be divided into internal and external factors [4]. Internal factors include age, gender, personality, motivation, and life values. Meanwhile, external factors include socioeconomic status, culture, social support, and religiosity. In the context of non-civil servant early childhood education teachers, economic limitations

often suppress psychological well-being, but religiosity and social support from the Islamic boarding school environment can be a positive counterbalance.

Several studies have emphasized the importance of teacher psychological well-being. According to Winefield et al. high levels of work stress can reduce teachers' psychological well-being, which impacts the quality of learning [25]. Conversely, teachers with good psychological well-being tend to be more patient, creative, and enthusiastic in teaching early childhood education. This demonstrates a close link between teachers' psychological well-being and the quality of education. The psychological well-being of non-civil servant early childhood education teachers presents its own challenges. Low income, unclear employment status, and demanding administrative workloads often lead to stress and feelings of underappreciation [8]. However, research shows that positive psychological factors such as gratitude and compliance can increase resilience and help teachers maintain their psychological well-being.

In the context of Islamic boarding school culture, teachers' psychological well-being is also influenced by spiritual and religious values. Adherence to Islamic boarding school rules and an attitude of gratitude instilled in daily life help teachers develop meaning and purpose in life. Therefore, despite facing economic constraints, non-civil servant early childhood education (PAUD) teachers in Islamic boarding schools still feel a sense of psychological well-being through the values of devotion and worship. Based on a literature review, psychological well-being can be understood as a multidimensional condition involving emotional, cognitive, social, and spiritual aspects. For non-civil servant early childhood education (PAUD) teachers, psychological well-being is not only a determinant of personal happiness but also has implications for the quality of early childhood learning. Therefore, understanding the factors influencing psychological well-being, including the role of obedience and gratitude, is crucial in efforts to improve the quality of education in Islamic boarding schools.

Discussion

The results of the literature review indicate that compliance and gratitude play a significant role in improving the psychological well-being of non-civil servant early childhood education (PAUD) teachers, particularly in Islamic boarding schools. Compliance based on awareness, religious values, and moral responsibility is an important asset for teachers to continue carrying out their duties despite facing various limitations. This is in line with the findings of Ahmad & Rachmawati that teachers who comply with school regulations tend to feel safer, more comfortable, and more satisfied in carrying out their professional roles [6]. Thus, compliance can be seen as a protective factor that maintains teachers' psychological stability.

Gratitude has also been shown to significantly contribute to the psychological well-being of early childhood education (ECE) teachers. Emmons & McCullough emphasized that gratitude fosters positive emotions, reduces stress, and increases life satisfaction. [7] Non-civil servant (CEC) ECE teachers who exhibit gratitude are better able to accept the

limitations of their working conditions and interpret them as part of their service. Research by Ismawati and Hernanda et al. supports these findings, demonstrating that gratitude is positively related to teachers' psychological well-being and work-life balance [13], [26].

The discussion also highlighted the importance of the cultural context of Islamic boarding schools. The values of obedience to the hierarchy of "Bhuppa' Bhâbbhu' Ghuru Rato" and gratitude instilled through religious teachings serve as spiritual foundations that strengthen teacher resilience. Obedience helps teachers feel protected within a clear social structure, while gratitude fosters meaning and motivation in their work. These religious values enable early childhood education teachers in Islamic boarding schools to remain resilient and dedicated despite financial and employment constraints.

However, this discussion also emphasized that compliance arising solely from external pressure can have negative impacts, such as stress, emotional exhaustion, and even burnout [12]. Therefore, it is important to distinguish between conscious compliance and forced compliance. Similarly, authentic gratitude is more effective in improving psychological well-being than mere perceived satisfaction. This demonstrates the need for coaching that fosters teachers' internal awareness, rather than simply emphasizing formal rules.

Practically, these literature findings have implications for the development of educational policy. Schools and Islamic boarding schools (pesantren) need to address teachers' psychological factors by providing space for spiritual development, strengthening the value of gratitude, and creating a clear yet humane regulatory system. The government is also expected to support the welfare of non-civil servant teachers through capacity-building and welfare programs, so that the values of obedience and gratitude can develop optimally under more supportive conditions.

Thus, this discussion concludes that obedience and gratitude are not only individual psychological factors, but also part of the social, cultural, and religious dynamics that shape the psychological well-being of early childhood teachers. A comprehensive understanding of these two variables can form the basis for interventions to improve teachers' quality of life and performance, ultimately contributing to the quality of early childhood education in Indonesia.

CONCLUSION

Fundamental Finding : This literature review confirms that obedience and gratitude play a crucial role in improving the psychological well-being of non-civil servant early childhood education (PAUD) teachers, particularly in Islamic boarding schools (pesantren). Obedience, grounded in self-awareness and religious values, fosters a sense of security, order, and satisfaction in carrying out tasks. Meanwhile, gratitude serves as a psychological mechanism that fosters positive emotions, strengthens social relationships, and helps teachers interpret limitations as part of their service. These two factors complement each other in maintaining teachers' psychological stability, enabling them to continue working with dedication despite financial and employment challenges.

The cultural and spiritual context of Islamic boarding schools reinforces the role of obedience and gratitude as foundations for psychological well-being. **Implication** : Therefore, improving the psychological well-being of non-civil servant early childhood education (PAUD) teachers can be achieved not only through material improvements but also through strengthening psychological and spiritual values. These findings are expected to provide a basis for schools, Islamic boarding school foundations, and the government in designing more comprehensive policies and development programs for PAUD teachers. **Limitation** : However, the scope of this literature review is limited to the psychological dimensions of obedience and gratitude within the specific context of Islamic boarding schools, which may not fully represent the diverse conditions of PAUD teachers in other educational and cultural settings. **Future Research** : Future research should focus on empirical investigations that quantitatively and qualitatively measure the impact of obedience and gratitude on teacher well-being, while also comparing different educational environments beyond Islamic boarding schools to broaden the generalizability of these findings.

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

The author expresses his deepest gratitude to all parties who have contributed to the preparation of this article. Special thanks are extended to the lecturers and academic supervisors who provided valuable guidance, direction, and input throughout the research and writing process. He also extends his appreciation to colleagues who shared their insights and ideas, enriching the study in this article. He also thanks the institutions and early childhood education teachers within the Islamic boarding school (pesantren) who inspired and motivated him in writing this article. Their dedication and sincerity in educating early childhood, despite various limitations, serve as an important foundation for the development of this literature study.

REFERENCES

- [1] C. Gustiana, *Pendidikan Anak Usia Dini sebagai Fondasi Bangsa*. 2019.
- [2] N. Farida, "Peran Guru PAUD dalam Pembentukan Karakter Anak," 2017.
- [3] R. M. Abdillah, A. Sukandar, and others, "Kesejahteraan Psikologis Guru dalam Konteks Pendidikan," 2023.
- [4] C. D. Ryff, "Happiness is everything, or is it? Explorations on the meaning of psychological well-being," *J. Pers. Soc. Psychol.*, vol. 57, no. 6, pp. 1069–1081, 1989.
- [5] A. Ahmad and H. Hodsay, "Peran Kepatuhan Guru terhadap Iklim Sekolah," *J. Pendidik.*, 2020.
- [6] R. Ahmad and R. Rachmawati, "Hubungan kepatuhan guru terhadap aturan sekolah dengan kesejahteraan psikologis," *J. Psikol. Pendidik.*, 2018.
- [7] R. A. Emmons and M. E. McCullough, *The Psychology of Gratitude*. New York: Oxford University Press, 2003.
- [8] A. Yiğit and H. Çakmak, "Compliance and its relation to workplace well-being," *J. Educ. Res.*, 2024.
- [9] A. Bandura, *Social Learning Theory*. Englewood Cliffs, NJ: Prentice Hall, 1977.
- [10] I. Ajzen, "The theory of planned behavior," *Organ. Behav. Hum. Decis. Process.*, vol. 50, pp. 179–211, 1991.

- [11] T. Blass, "The Milgram paradigm after 35 years: Some things we now know about obedience to authority," *J. Appl. Soc. Psychol.*, vol. 29, no. 5, pp. 955-978, 1999.
- [12] M. Jannah, "Kepatuhan, Stres, dan Burnout pada Tenaga Pendidik," 2020.
- [13] R. Ismawati, "Hubungan kebersyukuran dengan kesejahteraan psikologis guru," *J. Psikol. Pendidik. Indones.*, 2022.
- [14] M. E. P. Seligman, *Authentic Happiness: Using the New Positive Psychology to Realize Your Potential for Lasting Fulfillment*. New York: Free Press, 2004.
- [15] K. E. Fadhil, "Kebersyukuran sebagai strategi psikologis," *J. Psikol. Islam.*, 2021.
- [16] S. Lyubomirsky, "Why are some people happier than others?: The role of cognitive and motivational processes in well-being," *Am. Psychol.*, vol. 56, no. 3, pp. 239-249, 2001.
- [17] P. Fitzgerald, "Gratitude and its measurement," *J. Posit. Psychol.*, 1998.
- [18] T. Loi and S. Ng, "Gratitude and happiness: A cross-cultural study," *J. Happiness Stud.*, 2021.
- [19] X. Zheng and others, "Gratitude, teacher well-being, and teacher-student relationship," *Teach. Teach. Educ.*, 2024.
- [20] S. Yulianti, "Kebersyukuran dan kesejahteraan guru honorer," *J. Pendidik. dan Psikol.*, 2023.
- [21] A. Scarvanovi, "Kebersyukuran pada guru PAUD," *J. Ilm. Pendidik. Anak Usia Dini*, 2023.
- [22] E. Deci and R. M. Ryan, "Self-Determination Theory and the Facilitation of Intrinsic Motivation, Social Development, and Well-Being," *Am. Psychol.*, 2000.
- [23] M. E. P. Seligman, *Flourish: A Visionary New Understanding of Happiness and Well-being*. New York: Free Press, 2011.
- [24] D. G. Myers, *The Pursuit of Happiness*. New York: Avon, 2000.
- [25] A. H. Winefield, T. K. Gill, A. W. Taylor, and R. M. Pilkington, "Psychological well-being and psychological distress: is it necessary to measure both?," *Psychol. Well. Being.*, vol. 2, no. 3, pp. 1-14, 2012.
- [26] L. Hernanda and others, "Rasa syukur, work-life balance, dan kesejahteraan psikologis tenaga pengajar," *J. Hum.*, 2022.

***Yuniati Ningsih (Corresponding Author)**

University of 17 August 1945 Surabaya, Indonesia

Email: niania984@gmail.com

Muhammad Farid

University of 17 August 1945 Surabaya, Indonesia

E-mail: muhfaridrochim@gmail.com

Isrida Yul Arifiana

University of 17 August 1945 Surabaya, Indonesia

E-mail: akukakiss@gmail.com
